



Roche, JT (2017) Islam and Christianity in Medieval Anatolia. *Al-Masaq*, 29 (2). pp. 199-200. ISSN 0950-3110

Downloaded from: <https://e-space.mmu.ac.uk/620732/>

Publisher: Taylor & Francis (Routledge)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1080/09503110.2017.1327212>

Please cite the published version

<https://e-space.mmu.ac.uk>

Within a decade of the Byzantine defeat to Turkish forces at the Battle of Mantzikert in 1071 virtually the whole of Asia Minor was under the control of Turkish chieftains, a geopolitical condition that was only ever partly reversed in the peninsula's western lowlands. The Turkish invasions did not suddenly destroy Christianity in those regions permanently lost to the Byzantines, but the ways in which Muslim Turks and Christians then coexisted, and the gradual process of cultural, religious and societal transformation which medieval Anatolia experienced over the centuries following Mantzikert have been rarely investigated.

This volume seeks to address this negative neglect by focusing on Muslim-Christian relations and the development of Islam in Anatolia from the period of the Turkish invasions and first migrations in the latter half of the eleventh century through to late fourteenth century and the early Ottoman period. Contributors stress the paucity of Muslim chronicles originating in Anatolia over these centuries on a number of occasions throughout the book. The articles here therefore draw on an array of written sources including unpublished Muslim manuscript material and archival documents, and Latin, Greek and Armenian Christian texts, as well as material evidence.

The volume is divided into three parts. The first of these, 'Christian Experiences of Muslim Rule', opens with a contribution by Phillip Wood that examines some of the evidence for the continuation and transformation of Christian social and political life under Muslim rule in the Middle East during the first centuries of Muslim domination. Alex Beihammer's contribution opens the volume's examination of the consequences of the Turkish invasions in the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries and the emergence of a Muslim society in Anatolia as reflected in Greek, Armenian and Latin-crusader narrative sources. Peter Cowe shows how Armenian culture was profoundly affected by Islamic influences from the eleventh through to the fourteenth centuries. Scott Redford offers a critique of current scholarship on the spread of Islam as a result of intermarriage between Muslim men and Christian women, before arguing that unconverted Christian women and other 'marginal' groups such as slaves could play important roles in the economic and social life of parts of Muslim Anatolia. Johannes Preiser-Kapeller shows the complexity of commercial networks in which Muslim Anatolia was drawn in the thirteenth to the early fifteenth centuries. Johannes Pahlitzsch presents two case studies examining the fate of the Greek Orthodox communities of Ephesos and Nikaia in the fourteenth century under Aydınoğlu and Ottoman rule respectively.

The second part of the volume examines 'Artistic and Intellectual Encounters between Islam and Christianity'. Rustam Shukurov argues that the Byzantines were consistently selective in adopting eastern cultural influences, being more open to the non-religiously marked cultural influences of the 'Orient' while at the same time cleansing and avoiding Islamic material. Anthony Eastmond examines material evidence to suggest that it provided – at least at the popular level – a set of common ideas about the ways in which words and images could embody supernatural power that was shared across the region. Tolga B. Uyar argues that the popularity of 'Byzantine art' in thirteenth-century Cappadocia is best understood as a manifestation of the shared apotropaic and chivalric cultures of that time. Andrew Peacock provides an overview of a verse polemic in Persian composed in the early thirteenth century, which suggests a profound knowledge of Armenian beliefs on the part of its author. Salam Rassi shows how an early fourteenth-century compendium composed by a Nestorian churchman and polymath was influenced by the language of the Qur'an and Muslim theology.

The final part, 'The Formation of Islamic Society in Anatolia' begins with Rıza Yıldırım seeking to blur the traditional paradigmatic binary view of Anatolian Islam divided between Sunni and Shi'ite forms. Judith Pfeiffer focuses on the central Anatolian town of Kırşehir under Mongol rule and the development of Islamic institutions therein. Sara Nur Yıldız compares an Anatolian Turkish adaptation of a mystical Persian work and suggests that it reflects a struggle for spiritual purity in a land populated by a Christian majority. Ahmet T. Karamustafa explores the knowledge of Islam and Christianity as reflected in the Saltuk-name, the famous Anatolian Turkish epic originally compiled in the latter half of the fifteenth century.

A chronological bias towards the later centuries under consideration here is explicable given that the first generations of Türkmens left no written record of their invasions and migrations into Anatolia, and nor was this a period when writers in the traditional Muslim heartlands to the East were much concerned with events on the western marches of the Turkish world. The bias serves to remind us of how little we know about the period of the Turkish invasions and migrations during the late eleventh and twelfth centuries. It would be unwise to read back from flourishing and relatively peaceful periods of Turkish history to form *agumentum ex silentio* that Christian communities prospered in many of the smaller towns permanently lost to the Byzantines in the years after Mantzikert. Palaeoecological and paleoenvironmental evidence is beginning to testify to the ruptures caused by the Türkmens' invasions and migrations during these years and it adds considerable weight to the testimonies found in the various Christian narratives from the same period - however troublesome those accounts prove to be.

The sources for the later period are rather richer than is sometimes imagined, and what they often illuminate is that Christian communities – or at least certain people/groups within those communities - could and did thrive under Muslim rule. This volume provides clear challenges to the paradigm of the decline and destruction of Byzantine Christianity in Asia Minor at the hands of marauding Turkish raiders firmly established by Speros Vryonis in his *The Decline of Medieval Hellenism in Asia Minor and the Process of Islamization from the Eleventh through the Fifteenth Century* (Berkeley, 1971). This volume is therefore a substantial contribution to our understanding of Muslim-Christian interaction on the Anatolian peninsula during the medieval period. The process of the Islamisation of Anatolia remains enigmatic, but the scholarly strength of the types of micro-histories contained in a multi-disciplinary volume such as this can overturn outdated grand theoretical edifices. The editors are to be applauded for demonstrating the potential of multidimensional approaches to studying the complex historical transformation that is the Islamisation of Anatolia.